



THE OMBUDSMAN FOR ACADEMIC ETHICS AND PROCEDURES OF THE REPUBLIC OF LITHUANIA

DECISION REGARDING THE PUBLICATIONS OF SENIOR RESEARCH FELLOW OF LITHUANIAN CULTURE RESEARCH INSTITUTE PROF. A. ANDRIJAUSKAS

16 December 2015 No SP-24

Vilnius

The Ombudsman for Academic Ethics and Procedures of the Republic of Lithuania (hereinafter - the Ombudsman), <...> examined the complaint of M. P.¹ (hereinafter - the applicant) received in the Office of Ombudsman for Academic Ethics and Procedures of the Republic of Lithuania (hereinafter - the Office of Ombudsman) on 22 June 2015 and the submitted material, **and determined that:**

The applicant appealed to the Ombudsman with his complaint of “possible plagiarism” in publications of senior research fellow of Lithuanian Culture Research Institute prof. Antanas Andrijauskas “A Comparative History of the Idea of Civilization” (Vilnius, VDA publishing house, 2001), “The History and Theory of Cultural Studies” (Vilnius, VDA publishing house, 2003), “Profiles of Culture, Philosophy, and Art” (East-West-Lithuania) (Vilnius, KFMI publishing house, 2004.) and “Metamorphoses of Non-classical and Postmodern Philosophy” (Vilnius, “Vilniaus aukciono biblioteka, Meno rinka”, 2010).

The applicant states that of the four books “two are almost identical, although presented as different monographs, in the other two <...> coincide entire paragraphs”. The complaint contains two identical text fragments from A. Andrijauskas books “A Comparative History of the Idea of Civilization” and “The History and Theory of Cultural Studies”, as well as two identical fragments of texts from the books of the same author “Profiles of Culture, Philosophy and Art” (East-West-Lithuania) and “Metamorphoses of Non-classical and Postmodern Philosophy”. The article “Academician A. Andrijauskas is suspected of plagiarism” (published on the website “Radikalai”) is attached to the complaint.

The applicant requests the Ombudsman “to investigate possible plagiarism in books of A. Andrijauskas [a reference to the books]” (accompanying notes in angle brackets are ours).

<...>

1. Regarding the plagiarism in scientific publications by Prof. A. Andrijauskas

The details of publication “**A Comparative History of the Idea of Civilization**” by **A. Andrijauskas** (2001, Vilnius Academy of Fine Arts Publishing House, 628 pages) (hereinafter

¹ Applicant in the text of the Ombudsman’s resolution is given as a noun of masculine gender without linking it to the sex of the student, applicant

referred to as the first book) provide no type of publication (textbook, monograph, etc.). <...> The list of references includes links to more than 30 publications/editions of A. Andrijauskas (1994-2001). (Literature, pages 594-596). A comparative analysis of the book “A Comparative History of the Idea of Civilization” and other publications/editions of A. Andrijauskas listed in the reference was not performed in the Office of the Ombudsman.

The details of the publication “**The History and Theory of Cultural Studies**” by **A. Andrijauskas** (2003, Vilnius Academy of Fine Arts Publishing House, 636 pages.) (hereinafter referred to as the second book) indicate that “a textbook was published using the funds of the Ministry of Education of the Republic of Lithuania, recommended by the publishing commission of general textbooks of schools of higher education” (p. 4). <...> The links to publications/editions of A. Andrijauskas in the list of references indicates (Literatūra, pages 598-599.) the first book of A. Andrijauskas, without specifying the specific pages used.

The comparative analysis of the First and Second books of A. Andrijauskas revealed the coincidences of texts - about 120 pages, i.e. approximately 19% of the text from the First book is used in the Second book of A. Andrijauskas (with single changes of insignificant words). Coincidences of texts are presented in Annex 1 to this decision. Attention should be drawn to the fact that some coinciding text fragments are a full chapter or a few pages long. The Second book contains no citation references, footnotes to the text fragments that have already been published in the First book. As mentioned above, the First book is indicated in the reference list of the Second book as the source.

The details of the publication “**Profiles of Culture, Philosophy and Art**” by **A. Andrijauskas** (East-West-Lithuania) (2004, KFMI publishing house, 624 pages) (hereinafter referred to as the third book) provide no type of publication (textbook, monograph, etc.). <...> The links to publications/editions of A. Andrijauskas in the list of references indicates (Literatūra, pages 590-591) the first book of A. Andrijauskas, without specifying the specific pages used.

Considering the object of the applicant’s complaint, the Third book was not compared with the First book nor with the Second book.

The publication “Metamorphoses of Non-classical and Postmodern Philosophy” by **A. Andrijauskas** (2010, “Vilniaus Aukciono Biblioteka, Meno rinka”, 2010, 648 pages) (hereinafter referred to as the fourth book) is a monograph (as stated on page 648). The list of references includes the links to publications/editions of A. Andrijauskas (Literatūra, pages 612-613) where the third book of by A. Andrijauskas is indicated, without specifying the specific pages used.

The comparative analysis of the Third and Fourth books of A. Andrijauskas revealed the coincidences of the texts - about 130 pages, i.e. approximately 20% of the text from the third book is used in the Fourth book of A. Andrijauskas (with single changes of insignificant words). Coincidences of texts are presented in Annex 2 to this decision. Attention should be drawn to the fact that some coinciding text fragments are a full chapter or a few pages long. The Fourth book contains no citation references, footnotes to the text fragments that have already been published in the Third book. As mentioned above, the Third book is indicated in the reference list of the Fourth book as the source.

<...>

It should be noted that the concepts of “self-plagiarism” are not defined and established by the consensus of Lithuanian academic community. However, self-plagiarism in the practice of foreign countries is considered a breach of academic ethics, a type of plagiarism *in which the writer*

republishes a work in its entirety or reuses portions of a previously written text while authoring a new work.² Types of self-plagiarism are as follows:

- Re-publication of previously published article without informing the reader and the magazine publishers;
- General research material is provided in separate, smaller studies in order to increase the number of publications;
- The use of portions of texts (not) published earlier.³

L. Šarlauskienė scientific study “Good practice of plagiarism prevention in foreign schools of higher education” (ASU, 2012)⁴ states that “definition of self-plagiarism, as plagiarism, is a difficult task due to different perceptions of proper academic behaviour. <...> There are attitudes that it would be ethical to provide no more than 10% of information from previously published own works, citing it in quotes and providing the links to the original sources. <...> The scientists convey the experience of the editorial boards of scientific journals that newly presented publication should meet several key criteria: new objective or question of research should be formed, new theoretical arguments should be used, new or additional research data to identify interfaces should be used. <...> Bretag T. and S. Mahmud indicate that like in case of <...> plagiarism, in self-plagiarism cases, the author’s intention to deceive should always be taken into account. <...> Any cases of self-plagiarism or plagiarism in works of scientists have a significant negative impact on <...>.” (page 8).

Considering the fact that the coincidences of texts in publications of Prof. A. Andrijauskas “A Comparative History of the Idea of Civilization” and “The History and Theory of Cultural Studies”, as well as “Profiles of Culture, Philosophy and Art” (East-West-Lithuania) and “Metamorphoses of Non-classical and Postmodern Philosophy” have the signs of self-plagiarism, as it is defined in practice of foreign countries, however the aforementioned concept has not been assigned to violations of academic ethics by Lithuanian academic community yet, and therefore the Ombudsman has no reason to state that kind of violations in the said publications of A. Andrijauskas.

It should be noted that the Ombudsman applied to the Advisory Committee⁵ of the Office of the Ombudsman For Academic Ethics and Procedures of the Republic of Lithuania on 23 November 2015 in writing (letter No S-449) relating to the problems of self-plagiarism. The Advisory Committee believes that *the biggest problem of self-plagiarism occurs when the author, re-publishing his texts or their parts (without links and including in the list of references), assign them to the new publication, which is presented to gain financial benefit or otherwise (e.g., during the assessments) reporting for own scientific activity.*

<...>

² <http://cdn2.hubspot.net/hub/92785/file-5414624-pdf/media/ith-selfplagiarism-whitepaper.pdf>, 1 p. (previewed on the internet on 01/12/2015)

³ Ibidem

⁴ <http://dspace.lzuu.lt/bitstream/1/2509/3/Plagiato%20prevencijos%20geroji%20patirtis1.pdf> (previewed on the internet on 13/11/2015)

⁵ http://www.etika.gov.lt/?page_id=54

2. Regarding the recognition of publications of prof. A. Andrijauskas and submission for the attestation

<...>

The Office of the Ombudsman asked the Lithuanian Culture Research Institute by an e-mail on 7 and 23 November 2015 to provide the material of the two last assessments of prof. A. Andrijauskas. The institute submitted the material of the assessment of Prof. A. Andrijauskas in held in 2012 by the letter No IS-228 of 9 November 2015, the material of assessment held in 2007 was submitted by e-mail on 23 November 2015. After the examination of the assessment materials and the list of scientific publications, it was found that:

1. During the assessment held in 2007, the list of main scientific publications of Prof. A. Andrijauskas for the period from 2002 to 2006 include the First and Third book, both indicated as monographs. There are six monographs in total in the list. The list of main publications indicates that these publications “meet the qualification requirements defined in Order No ISAK-879 of 24 June 2003 of the Minister of Education and Science.”⁶

Also noteworthy the record made in the protocol No 14 of 8 March 2007 of the meeting of Department of Comparative Cultural Studies at the Institute for Culture, Philosophy, and Art presented in the material of assessment held in 2007 stating that the meeting discussed “the assessment of the Head of Department Prof. Habil. Dr. A. Andrijauskas for the past 5 years;” “Prof. Habil. Dr. A. Andrijauskas informed that he wrote a5 monographs, one textbook <...> during the past five years” (as mentioned above, six monographs but not five are indicated in the column “Monographs” of the list of main publications provided for the assessment). Prof. Habil. Dr. A. Andrijauskas is indicated as the Chairman of the meeting in the protocol. Resolution “The department unanimously decided to assess Prof. Habil. Dr. A. Andrijauskas for the last 5 years.” Protocol is signed by the “The Chairman of Commission Prof. Habil. Dr. A. Andrijauskas.” *In view of the content of these documents, it should be concluded that Prof. A. Andrijauskas did not withdraw from his own assessment.*

In its letter No IS-228 of 9 November 2015, Lithuanian Culture Research Institute indicated that Prof. A. Andrijauskas was elected Chairman of the Attestation and Competition Commission of the Institute on 28 April 2015; in addition, Prof. A. Andrijauskas is a member of Academic Ethics Commission of the Institute;⁷

2. During the assessment held in 2012, the fourth book was included in the list of 5 the most important scientific works on research part topic of Prof. A. Andrijauskas for the period from 2006 to 2011 and the list of monographs of the year 2010. The list of main publications indicates that these publications “meet the qualification requirements defined in Order No V-503 of 12 April 2010 of the Minister of Education and Science.”⁸

⁶ Order No ISAK-879 of 24 June 2003 of the Minister of Education of the Republic of Lithuania “On the approval of the qualifications requirements for the members of the Councils for the defence of doctoral theses, supervisors of postgraduates, consultants, opponents of dissertations and other scientists, who appear on the list in order to gain the right of graduate school”.

⁷ http://www.lkti.lt/public/DOKUMENTAI/Akademines_etikos_komisija_2015-05-26.pdf (previewed on the internet on 13/11/2015)

⁸ Order No V-503 of 12 April 2010 of the Minister of Education of the Republic of Lithuania “On the amendment of the Order No ISAK-625 of 31 March 2006 of the Minister of Education of the Republic of Lithuania “On the approval of the qualifications requirements for the members of the Councils for the defence of doctoral theses, supervisors of postgraduates, consultants, opponents of dissertations and other scientists, who appear on the list in order to gain the right of graduate school”

In this regard, it must be concluded that the part (approximately 20%) of the text of the Third book, literally transferred to the Fourth book without citation marks, was submitted for the assessment of Prof. A. Andrijauskas twice (in 2007 and 2012) as the original material.

It should be noted that the rest portion of the Fourth book was not examined at the Office of the Ombudsman in terms of novelty and scholarliness (with regard to the definition of “scientific monograph” provided in paragraph 6 of the Methodology, which states that “the monograph should include clear and substantial scientific elements of originality typical of each area of science”).

In view of the foregoing, plagiarism in scientific publications of Prof. Andrijauskas “A Comparative History of the Idea of Civilization” and “The History and Theory of Cultural Studies”, as well as “Profiles of Culture, Philosophy and Art” (East-West-Lithuania) and “Metamorphoses of Non-classical and Postmodern Philosophy” was not determined; however, the replication of large part of own texts without citation marks was determined; also, it was found that the part of the Third book re-published in the Fourth book without citation marks was submitted for two assessments of the author (in 2007 and 2012).

The mission of Lithuanian Culture Research Institute, whose senior research fellow is Prof. A. Andrijauskas, defined in the statute of the Institute, approved by the Resolution No 1792 of 23 December 2009 of the Government of the Republic of Lithuania (hereinafter referred to as the Statute), is “to carry out long-term high-level research in the fields of philosophy and history of art and interdisciplinary subjects, works of social and cultural development in the field of Lithuanian cultural heritage and contemporary cultural processes, relevant for the development of Lithuanian state, society and culture and conforming to the provisions of European research space” (our underline). In its goals of activity, the Institute declares the objective “to disseminate scientific knowledge in society”, “to contribute to the education of knowledge-open society” and to “ensure the scientific competence of an international level” (paragraphs 7.3, 7.4 of the Statute). Subparagraph 5.1 of Code of Academic Ethics of the Institute approved by the Resolution (meeting protocol No MTP-2) of 26 May 2015 of Scientific Council of the Institute provides that “scientific activities must be based on the ideals of fair investigation and pursuit of truth.” In order to contribute to the quality of education and studies, upholding the principles of academic responsibility and ethical research practices, the Ombudsman promotes the staff of Lithuanian Culture Research Institute to adhere to these academic values set.

The Ombudsman, in accordance with subparagraph 9, paragraph 12 Article 18 of the Law on Higher Education and Research of the Republic of Lithuania **decided as follows:**

To recognize the complaint of applicant Mr P. as unjustified relating to the plagiarism in publications of Prof. A. Andrijauskas “A Comparative History of the Idea of Civilization” and “The History and Theory of Cultural Studies”, as well as “Profiles of Culture, Philosophy and Art” (East-West-Lithuania) and “Metamorphoses of Non-classical and Postmodern Philosophy”.
